



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION  
QUARTERLY

Formerly published under the title of PUBLICATIONS OF THE AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

---

THIRD SERIES.  
VOL. IX, No. 1.

ISSUED QUARTERLY.  
PRICE, \$4.00 PER YEAR.

---

PAPERS AND DISCUSSIONS

OF THE

TWENTIETH ANNUAL  
MEETING

MADISON, WIS.

DECEMBER 28-31

---

APRIL 1908

---

PUBLISHED BY THE  
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION  
PRINCETON. N. J.  
LONDON: SWAN SONNENSCHN & CO.

---

Application made for entry as second class matter at the Princeton N. J. Post Office

---

PRICE, IN PAPER, \$1.25

# AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Organized at Saratoga, September 9, 1885.

---

## EX-PRESIDENTS

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| *FRANCIS A. WALKER<br>Massachusetts Institute of Technology. | ARTHUR T. HADLEY,<br>Yale University.         |
| *CHARLES F. DUNBAR,<br>Harvard University.                   | RICHARD T. ELY,<br>University of Wisconsin.   |
| JOHN B. CLARK,<br>Columbia University.                       | EDWIN R. A. SELIGMAN,<br>Columbia University. |
| HENRY C. ADAMS,<br>University of Michigan.                   | FRANK W. TAUSSIG,<br>Harvard University.      |
| JEREMIAH W. JENKS,<br>Cornell University.                    |   |
- 

## OFFICERS FOR THE YEAR 1908

### *President*

SIMON N. PATTEN,  
University of Pennsylvania.

### *Vice-Presidents*

DAVIS R. DEWEY,  
Mass. Inst. of Technology.

JAMES B. DILL,  
East Orange, N. J.

JOHN M. GLENN,  
New York City.

### *Secretary and Treasurer*

WINTHROP M. DANIELS,  
Princeton University, Princeton, N. J.

### *Publication Committee*

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| JACOB H. HOLLANDER, Chairman,<br>Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Md. | A. W. FLUX,<br>McGill University.             |
| CHARLES J. BULLOCK,<br>Harvard University.                                | DAVID KINLEY,<br>University of Illinois.      |
| JAMES W. CROOK,<br>Amherst College  | WILLIAM A. SCOTT,<br>University of Wisconsin. |

### *Editor of the Economic Bulletin*

E. W. KEMMERER,  
Cornell University, Ithaca, N. Y.

### *Executive Committee*

#### *Ex-Officio Members—*

THE PRESIDENT  
THE EX-PRESIDENTS  
THE VICE-PRESIDENTS  
THE SECRETARY-TREASURER  
THE CHAIRMAN PUBL. COM.

#### *Elected Members—*

FRANK H. DIXON, Dartmouth College  
HENRY C. EMERY, Yale University  
FRANK A. FETTER, Cornell University  
JOHN H. GRAY, University of Minnesota  
B. H. MEYER, University of Wisconsin  
HENRY R. SEAGER, Columbia University

Inquiries and other communications regarding membership, meetings, and the general affairs of the Association, as well as orders for publications, should be addressed to the *Secretary of the American Economic Association*, Princeton University, Princeton, N. J.

\*Deceased.

AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION  
QUARTERLY

Formerly published under the title of PUBLICATIONS OF THE AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

---

THIRD SERIES.  
VOL. IX, No. 1.

ISSUED QUARTERLY.  
PRICE, \$4.00 PER YEAR.

---

PAPERS AND DISCUSSIONS  
OF THE  
TWENTIETH ANNUAL  
MEETING

MADISON, WIS.

DECEMBER 28-31

---

APRIL, 1908

---

PUBLISHED BY THE  
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION  
PRINCETON, N. J.  
LONDON: SWAN SONNENSCHN & CO.

Copyright, 1908, by  
AMERICAN ECONOMIC ASSOCIATION

Printed by  
PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

## TABLE OF CONTENTS.

PAPERS AND DISCUSSIONS :	PAGE
The Principles of Government Control of Business. Presidential Address by J. W. Jenks.....	I
Are Savings Income? Irving Fisher.....	21
Discussion on Are Savings Income:	
W. M. Daniels.....	48
F. A. Fetter.....	51
A. W. Flux.....	55
J. F. Crowell.....	57
M. H. Robinson.....	57
Agricultural Economics: Round Table:	
T. N. Carver.....	59
K. L. Butterfield.....	60
E. D. Jones.....	62
R. P. Teele.....	64
F. W. Blackmar.....	66
J. G. Thompson.....	68
W. A. Peck.....	71
E. C. Parker.....	73
D. Kinley .....	75
B. H. Hibbard.....	76
H. C. Taylor.....	79
W. D. Hoard.....	81
J. M. Glenn.....	82
Transportation—The Basis of Reasonable Railway Rates:	
Round Table:	
B. H. Meyer.....	83
H. S. Smalley.....	86
H. Erickson .....	95
General discussion .....	102
Money and Banking: Round Table:	
D. R. Dewey.....	104
W. A. Scott.....	109
I. A. Loos.....	113
F. L. McVey.....	113
Agreements in Political Economy: Round Table:	
C. B. Fillebrown.....	117
T. N. Carver.....	120
F. A. Fetter.....	121

	PAGE
C. H. Brough.....	122
J. H. Hollander.....	123
Economic Theory and Labor Legislation. Richard T. Ely..	124
The Normal Labor Day in Coal Mines. T. K. Urdahl.....	154
Workingman's Insurance in Illinois. Charles R. Henderson	183
The Relation of the United States Treasury to the Money Market. David Kinley .....	199
The Relation of the United States Treasury to General Finance. Lyman J. Gage.....	212
The United States Treasury and the Money Market. A. Piatt Andrew .....	218
Discussion on the Relation of the United States Treasury to the Money Market:	
E. W. Bemis.....	232
A. R. Foote.....	233
W. A. Scott.....	235
D. Kinley .....	237
The Public Service Commissions Law of New York State. Thomas M. Osborne.....	238
Public Service Commissions. William H. Hatton.....	263
Discussion on Public Service Commissions:	
G. B. Hudnall.....	279
J. H. Gray.....	289
E. W. Bemis.....	304
G. E. Hooker.....	305
A. R. Foote.....	307
M. S. Dudgeon.....	308
<b>INDEX .....</b>	<b>311</b>